Spain

by

Javier Martínez-Torrón
Professor of Law at Complutense University, Madrid; Doctor utroque iure (of Law and of Canon Law)

This monograph has been reviewed by the Author and is up-to-date as of January 2018
The Author

Javier Martínez-Torrón is Professor of Law at Complutense University (Madrid) and doctor iure (of Law and of Canon Law). Born in 1955, he studied Law and Canon Law at the Universities of Seville, Granada and Navarra. He joined the Law School of Complutense University in 1984 as associate professor. He obtained his first chair as catedrático at the University of Granada, in 1993, where he was director of the area of Law and Religion (1993–2000) and founded the seminar of comparative law in 1997. In 2000, he returned to Complutense University, where he has been director of the Department of Law and Religion (2009–2017). He has taught, lectured or been visiting scholar at more than eighty universities of the five continents, among them Cambridge, Oxford, Harvard, Chicago, Berkeley, Columbia, Stanford, Ottawa, Freiburg (Germany), Turin, UNAM (National Autonomous University of Mexico), Haifa, and Catholic University of Chile. Since 2001, he has been teaching Comparative Law at the Summer Law Courses of Saint Louis University (Madrid campus). He is Vice-President of the Department of Canon Law and Church-State Relations of the Spanish Royal Academy of Jurisprudence and Legislation (1994). He has been a member of the Advisory Commission on Religious Freedom in the Spanish Ministry of Justice (2002–2014) and of the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Council on Freedom of Religion of Belief (2005–2013). He was a member of the founding directive board of the first Spanish legal periodical specifically focused on law and religion studies (Anuario de Derecho Eclesiástico del Estado, 1985). He is the founder and co-editor of the Revista General de Derecho Canónico y Derecho Eclesiástico del Estado (2003), the first electronic legal periodical in Spain specialized on law and religions issues and canon law. He is also a member of the editorial boards of the Ecclesiastical Law Journal (2006) and the Oxford Journal of Law and Religion (2011), as well as of the International Advisory Board of the Revista Latinoamericana de Derecho y Religión (Chile, 2015). He is the author of numerous books and articles, published in 23 countries – 22 books as author or editor and more than 120 essays in legal periodicals or book chapters. His
The Author

writings have been published in Spanish, English, Italian, French, Russian, Polish, Lithuanian, Slovakian, Turkish, Indonesian, Chinese, Vietnamese and Catalan. His research is characterized by a predominant interest in comparative and international law issues relating to the treatment of freedom of religion and belief, and to the evolution of Western legal traditions. In 1998 he received the Arturo Carlo Jemolo Award (University of Turin) for his book *Le obiezioni di coscienza. Profili di diritto comparato* (co-authored with Rafael Navarro-Valls, 1995). His other books include: *Separatismo y cooperación en los acuerdos del Estado con las minorías religiosas* (1994); *Anglo-American Law and Canon Law. Canonical Roots of the Common Law Tradition* (1998); *Religión, derecho y sociedad* (1999); *Conflictos entre conciencia y ley. Las objeciones de conciencia*, with Rafael Navarro-Valls (2nd ed., 2012); *Tensiones entre libertad de expresión y libertad religiosa* (editor with Santiago Cañamero, 2014); *Religion and the Secular State* (editor with W. Cole Durham Jr, 2015); and *Great Christian Jurists in Spanish History* (editor with Rafael Domingo, forthcoming in April 2018).
Table of Contents

The Author 3
List of Abbreviations 13
Preface 15
General Introduction 17
§1. General Background of the Country 17
   I. Basic Information 17
   II. Political and Legal Structure 19
§2. Social Facts about Religion 20
§3. Historical Background: Religion in the History of Spain 23
   I. First to Fifteenth Centuries 23
   II. Fifteenth to Twentieth Centuries 25
   III. From the Second Republic to General Franco’s Regime 28

Part I. Legal Framework and Sources 31
Chapter 1. Constitutional Position of Religion 31
Chapter 2. Other Legislations with Regard to Religion 35
§1. The Organic Law on Religious Freedom 35
§2. Agreements with the Holy See (The Concordat) 40
§3. Cooperation Agreements with Other Religious Communities 41
§4. Other Laws and Regulations 42
Chapter 3. Typology of the System 44
§1. Religious Freedom 44
Table of Contents

§2. **Equality** 45

§3. **State Neutrality** 47

§4. **State Cooperation with Religion** 47

§5. **Bilateral Sources of Law** 49

§6. **Case Law of the Constitutional Court with Respect to the ‘Informing’ Principles** 49

Part II. Religious Freedom in General 53

Chapter 1. Individual Religious Freedom 53

§1. **Normative Framework** 53

§2. **Protected Aspects of Religious Freedom** 55

I. Internal and External Dimension of Religious Freedom 55

II. Freedom to Choose 56

III. Freedom to Manifest or Not to Manifest 57

IV. Freedom of Worship 58

V. Right to Religious Assistance 60

VI. Freedom of Teaching 60

VII. Right to Non-discrimination 61

VIII. Freedom of Conscience 62

IX. Compliance with Religious Dietary Rules 63

§3. **Judicial Protection of Religious Freedom** 64

§4. **Protection of Religious Freedom by Criminal Law** 66

§5. **Limitations on Religious Freedom** 66

§6. **Parental Custody and the Religious Freedom of Minors** 69

Chapter 2. Freedom of Conscience and Legal Obligations: Conscientious Objections 73

§1. **Concept of Conscientious Objection** 73

§2. **Some Basic Criteria for the Legal Analysis of Conscientious Objections** 74

§3. **The General Position of the Constitutional Court** 76

6 – Spain
Table of Contents

§4. Conscientious Objection to Military Service 78
§5. Conscientious Objection to Abortion 80
§6. Conscientious Objections of Pharmacists 80
§7. Conscientious Objection to Medical Treatments 80
§8. Conscientious Objection to Educational Contents or Practices 81

I. School Activities and Religious Observance of Holy Days 81
II. Freedom of Conscience and Homeschooling 82
III. Objection to Specific School Subjects 83
IV. The Case of Conscientious Objection to Education for Citizenship 84


I. The Use of Personal Religious Symbols in the School Environment 89
II. The Use of Personal Religious Symbols in Public Spaces 90
III. The Use of Personal Religious Symbols at Work 93
IV. ‘Secular’ Objections to the Use of Religious Symbols in Public Institutions 94

§10. Conscientious Objections in Labour Relations 97

I. European and Spanish Normative Framework 97
II. The Restrictive Approach of 1992 Agreements to the Observance of Sabbath 98
III. The Case Law on Sabbath Rest 100
IV. Other Claims of Indirect Religious Discrimination in Employment 101

§11. Conscientious Objection in the Public Service 101

I. Conscientious Objection to Promissory Oaths 101
II. Conscientious Objection to Be Part of a Jury 103
III. Conscientious Objection to Be Part of a Polling Station 105
IV. Conscientious Objection to Perform a Ceremony of Same-Sex Marriage 106

Chapter 3. Collective Religious Freedom 108
Chapter 4. Organizational Religious Freedom 113
Table of Contents

§1. Legal Personality, Religious Freedom and State Cooperation with Religious Communities .................................. 113

§2. The Registry of Religious Entities .............................................................................................................. 116

I. Basic Notions and Structure ....................................................................................................................... 116
II. Process and Effects of Registration .......................................................................................................... 117
III. The RER and the Legal Concept of Religion ............................................................................................. 119
IV. Registration of Internal Associations and Foundations of Religious Communities .................................. 121

§3. The Advisory Commission on Religious Freedom .......................................................................................... 123

Part III. Legal Status of Religious Communities ............................................................................................... 127

Chapter 1. Formal Status of Religious Communities ............................................................................................ 127
Chapter 2. Autonomy of Religious Communities ................................................................................................ 132
Chapter 3. Places of Worship and Meeting ....................................................................................................... 134

§1. A Broad Concept of Place of Worship ......................................................................................................... 134

§2. The Inviolability of Places of Worship ........................................................................................................ 135

§3. Places of Worship and Urban Planning ........................................................................................................ 136

§4. Privileges Concerning Expropriation, Demolition, Immunity from Seizure and Taxes ................................ 139

Chapter 4. Fundamental Rights and Religious Communities ................................................................................ 140

§1. The Protection of Fundamental Rights of Religious Communities ............................................................... 140

§2. The Protection of Fundamental Rights by Religious Communities ............................................................ 141

Chapter 5. Contractual Religious Freedom ......................................................................................................... 144

§1. The Concordat with the Catholic Church .................................................................................................... 144

§2. Cooperation Agreements with Other Religious Communities .................................................................... 148

Chapter 6. Religious Assistance in Public Institutions ........................................................................................ 152
Table of Contents

Part IV. International, Transnational, Regional Effects on Religious Communities  157
Chapter 1. International Law Effects on Religious Communities  157
Chapter 2. Transnational Law Effects on Religious Communities  162
Chapter 3. Regional Law Effects on Religious Communities  164

Part V. Religion and Politics  165
Chapter 1. Religion Influence in Politics  165
Chapter 2. Political Influence in Religion  168
Chapter 3. Interaction Between Religion and State on a Political and Legal Level  170

Part VI. Labour Law Within Religious Communities  173
Chapter 1. Scope of Application of Labour Law  173
Chapter 2. Religious Ministers and Labour Law  174
Chapter 3. Other Church Employees and Labour Law  177

Part VII. Religious Communities and Protections of the Individual  181
Chapter 1. Protection of Privacy  181
Chapter 2. Freedom to Marry  184
Chapter 3. Freedom of Expression  186
Chapter 4. Due Process Norms and Religious Groups  187
Chapter 5. Professional Secrecy  189
Chapter 6. Medical Deontology  191
§1. Conscientious Objection to Abortion  191
§2. Conscientious Objections of Pharmacists  193
§3. Conscientious Objection to Medical Treatments  195
# Table of Contents

I. The Law on the Patient’s Autonomy 195
II. Objection to Medical Treatment of Adults 196
III. Objection to Medical Treatment of Minors 197
IV. Objection to Medical Treatment and Criminal Liability 198
V. Objection to Medical Treatment and Reimbursement of Hospital Expenses 199

Chapter 7. Non-discrimination 201

Chapter 8. Penal Law and Religion 203

Part VIII. Church Financing 209

Chapter 1. Direct Financing of Religious Communities 210

§1. DIRECT FINANCING OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH 210

§2. DIRECT FINANCING OF OTHER RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES 211

Chapter 2. Indirect Financing of Religious Communities 214

§1. NON-TAXATION AND TAX EXEMPTIONS 214

§2. TAX-DEDUCTIBLE DONATIONS 216

§3. OTHER ECONOMIC CONTRIBUTIONS 217

Part IX. Education 219

Chapter 1. Religious Education in Public and Private Schools 220

§1. TEACHING OF CATHOLIC RELIGION 221

I. The Normative Framework 221
II. The Case Law of the Constitutional Court 224
   A. Courses on Catholic Religion 224
   B. Religion Teachers 225

§2. TEACHING OF RELIGIOUS DOCTRINES OTHER THAN CATHOLIC 225

§3. THE POSSIBILITY OF NEUTRAL TEACHING ON RELIGIONS AND BELIEFS 227

§4. RELIGIOUS SYMBOLS IN PUBLIC SCHOOLS 229

Chapter 2. Religious Schools 230
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part X. Matrimonial and Family Law</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1. Legal Position of Religious Marriage</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§1. The Right to a Religious Marriage</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§2. The Civil Effects of Catholic Marriages</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§3. The Civil Effects of Religious Marriages Other than Catholic</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2. Legal Position of Religious Family Law</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part XI. Religion and Culture</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1. Religion and Art</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2. Religion and Media</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3. Religion and Civil Society</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4. Religion and Public Debate</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selected Bibliography</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>